

Honourable Hayk Marutyan Mayor of Yerevan C/o David Tshgnavoryan Advisor to the Mayor Tel. +374-11-514158 C/o Mr Karen Harutyunyan Mayor Assistant Tel. +347-11-514120 mayor@yerevan.am info@yerevan.am

Mr. Vladimir Simonyan Director of Yerevan Zoo <u>director@yerevanzoo.am</u> <u>info@yerevanzoo.am</u> Tel. +374-10-562362

01st September 2021

Dear Mayor Marutvan and Mr Simonyan,

Bunka the Young Bull Elephant at the Yerevan Zoo

The Pro Elephant Network (PREN) consists of an international community of diverse individuals and organizations, comprising specific expertise, on wild and captive African and Asian elephants, including the fields of science, health, conservation, welfare, economics, community leadership, social justice and the law¹.

We have received reports about the solitary elephant resident at the Yerevan Zoo – a young bull called Bunka; members of PREN as well as private individuals, have visited him in Yerevan.

As you are aware, maintaining an elephant in a zoo requires great commitment, both in terms of managing the elephant's diet² and health care provision³ as well as nurturing his mental wellbeing⁴.

Members of PREN have contributed in recent years to extensive research and to the recognition of who elephants are and of their needs⁵. Results have shown that despite consistent efforts in providing

¹ <u>Members of PREN – PRO ELEPHANT NETWORK</u>

² Ullrey et al 1997 Elephants: Nutrition and dietary husbandry

³ Meehan et al 2016 determining connections between the daily lives of zoo elephants and their welfare.

⁴ Greco et al 2016 Using epidemiology to better understand stereotypic behaviour in elephants in zoos

⁵ Naoko Irie et al, 2009. Elephant psychology: What we know and what we would like to know



enrichment at the zoo, the needs of elephants are still compromised⁶. Not only are captive elephants likely to acquire physical ailments that invariably shorten their lifespan⁷, they are also prone to developing psychological issues that can render depression⁸, and aggressive behaviour, particularly in the case of solitary bulls⁹.

Essentially, elephants need more than just food and veterinary care – both of which we are certain that the hardworking staff of Yerevan Zoo are offering Bunka. Elephants need an appropriate social environment¹⁰, space¹¹ and mental stimulation¹². Elephants crave large territories to move about in and a great amount of exercise.¹³ Elephants also need the companionship of other elephants to maintain good physical and mental health. Contrary to general belief, elephant bulls are not naturally solitary animals¹⁴.

There is growing evidence that, of all animals, elephants are among those who suffer the most in captivity¹⁵.

We are aware that the Yerevan zoo is a candidate for membership of the European Association of Zoos and Aquaria¹⁶ (EAZA). In order for this candidacy to be considered the zoo personnel underwent animal welfare training which was organised by the EAZA academy in 2014. Members of PREN commend the zoo for its commitment to welfare and for their effort to provide enrichment for Bunka. It is our continued belief that keeping the elephant in the Yerevan zoo is unfavourable and this might have negatively impacted upon the EAZA membership status.

Members of the Pro Elephant Network and other wildlife organizations have participated in the successful relocation and reintegration of elephants, particularly solitary ones into natural environments¹⁷ and to global sanctuaries. Elephant sanctuaries have sprung up around the world from Tennessee¹⁸ to Brazil¹⁹ to Cambodia²⁰ and California²¹.

⁶ Clubb R., Rowcliffe M., Lee P., Mar K.U., Moss C. & Mason G.J. 2008. Compromised survivorship in zoo elephants. Science, 322:1649.

⁷ Wiese & Willis 2004 Calculation of longevity and life expectancy in captive elephants

⁸Bradshaw et al, 2005. Elephant Breakdown; Bell Rizzolo J. et al, 20016. Prevalence and Patterns of Complex PTSD in Asian Elephants (Elephas maximus)

⁹ C.M. Doyle, personal communication, November 4, 2020

¹⁰ Moss CJ & Poole JH 1983. Relationships and Social Structure of African Elephants. In: Primate Social Relationships; An integrated approach. R Hinde (Ed). Blackwell Publ

¹¹ McGreevy 2007 How much space does an elephant need? Leighty et al 2010 assessment of the use of exhibit space and resources by African elephants

¹² https://theconversation.com/the-neural-cruelty-of-captivity-keeping-large-mammals-in-zoos-and-aquariums-damages-their-brains-142240

¹³Poole & Granli 2008 Mind & Movement

¹⁴ Goldenberg et al 2014 Controlling for behavioural state reveals social dynamics among male African elephants

¹⁵ Professor Lori Marino 2021 <u>Big Brains in Small Spaces – the Impact of Confinement on the Brains of Cetaceans and</u> <u>Elephants - Bing video</u>

¹⁶ European Association of Zoos and Aquaria » EAZA

¹⁷ Liv Baker et al, 2020. Asian elephant rescue, rehabilitation and rewilding

¹⁸ The Elephant Sanctuary in Tennessee

¹⁹ <u>Global Sanctuary for Elephants - Elephant Sanctuary Brazil (globalelephants.org)</u>

²⁰ Elephant Valley Project (EVP) - Elephant Sanctuary, Mondulkiri Cambodia

²¹ Performing Animal Welfare Society -- PAWS (pawsweb.org)



PREN members would very much like to engage with you to discuss the welfare and wellbeing of Bunka and to discuss suitable options for his future that would be compatible with his biological, psychological and social needs.

There are many examples of zoos around the world (in Argentina²², Chile²³, Alaska²⁴, Pakistan²⁵, etc.) that in recent times have recognised that, despite their best efforts, they have been unable to meet the needs of their elephants; they have decided to prioritise the welfare needs of elephants and have agreed to translocate them to more suitable environments where the elephant can get more physical and psychological comfort.

Cher, an international icon of Armenian heritage, was recently involved with the relocation of an elephant, Kaavan, from the Islamabad zoo to a wildlife sanctuary in Cambodia. This event made global news²⁶; the international publicity positively highlighted the administrators of the zoo in question.

PREN members know that Armenia would receive the same international praise if the zoo administrators were able to engage with our elephant specialists in order to find the best solution for Bunka and to commit to ending the captivity of elephants at the Yerevan zoo.

We would be delighted to engage with you further on this matter and we hope you will consider allowing a visit from our elephant specialists, to Yerevan, as and when appropriate.

Yours sincerely,

Solo

Stefania Falcon PREN Coordinator <u>stefania@proelephantnetwork.org</u> Mobile +27 (0) 73 301–21-07



www.proelephantnetwork.org

MEMBERS OF PREN:

Owais Awan Suparna Baksi-Ganguly Advocate High Court, Islamabad President and Co-Founder, Wildlife Rescue & Rehabilitation Center, Bangalore, India

²² How to Move Your Elephant During a Pandemic - The New York Times (nytimes.com)

²³ Last Performing Circus Elephant of Chile is Rescued and Moved to New Sanctuary to Live Out Her Golden Years (goodnewsnetwork.org)

²⁴ <u>Alaska's only elephant heads to California (nbcnews.com)</u>

²⁵ Pakistan to relocate lonely elephant to Cambodia sanctuary, South Asia News & Top Stories - The Straits Times

²⁶ Cher rescued an elephant then sang him 'My Way' - CNN



Dr Brett Bard Dr Jessica Bell Rizzolo

Janey Clegg Professor David Bilchitz

Megan Carr Lenin Chisaira Dr Betsy Coville Harvey Croze Nomusa Dube David Ebert

Stefania Falcon Daniela Freyer Michele Franko Chief Stephen Fritz Dr Toni Frohoff Dr Marion E. Garai Rachel Harris Dr Ross Harvey Heike Henderson-Altenstein Alok Hissarwala Gupta

Iris Ho Peter Hodgskin Lynne James Dr Mark Jones David Kabambo

Dr Paula Kahumbu Professor Mohan Kharel Nuria Maldonado Jim Karani Dr Winnie Kiiru Brigitte Kornetzky Kahindi Lekalhaile Dr Smaragda Louw Giorgio Lombardi Linda Masudze

Veterinarian. South Africa Postdoctoral Researcher, the Conservation Criminology Lab, Dep of Fisheries and Wildlife, Michigan State University Committee Member, SPCA Mutare, Zimbabwe Director, South African Institute for Advanced Constitutional, Public and Human Rights and International Law - South Africa Founder, Rhinos in Africa Founder, Advocates 4 Earth – Green Law Connect, Zimbabwe Wildlife Veterinarian – USA Collaborating Researcher – Amboseli Trust for Elephants – Kenya Founder, Zimbabwe Elephant Foundation Advocate, Founder Director of The Animal Defense Partnership -USA Co-Founder, Future 4 Wildlife – South Africa Co-Founder, Pro Wildlife, Germany Captive Elephant Caregiver and Advocate - USA Indigenous Leader, South Peninsula Khoi Council - South Africa Ethologist and Behavioral Biologist, Founder of TerraMar Elephant Behavior Specialist - South Africa Managing Director, Elephant Human Relations Aid, Namibia Environmental Economist, Botswana Director, Future for Elephants e.V. Elephant Specialist, Federation of Indian Animal Protection Organizations Senior Wildlife Specialist, The Humane Society International Founder, Hands-off Fernkloof, South Africa Independent, Elephant Conservation, Zimbabwe Veterinarian, Born Free Foundation - UK Founder Director of Peace for Conservation - Wildlife Management -Tanzania WildlifeDirect, Kenya Tribhuvan University, Kathmandu, Nepal Ecologist, Environmental Science, Max Plank Institute Advocate, Lawyers for Animal Protection in Africa – Kenya Founder, Conservation Kenya President and Founder of Elefanten in Not - Switzerland / India Africa Network for Animal Welfare, Kenya Director, Ban Animal Trading, South Africa Warden Vogelgat Private Nature Reserve, South Africa Advocate 4 Earth, Zimbabwe



Varda Mehrotra	Environmentalist, Climate Crisis Researcher – India
Dr Nurzhafarina Binti Othman	Founder: Seratu Aatai, Elephant Conservation and Research
	Coordinator at HUTAN-KOCP - Malaysia
Sharon Pincott	Elephant Behavioural Specialist, ex-Hwange, Zimbabwe
Michele Pickover	Director, EMS Foundation, South Africa
Dr Yolanda Pretorius	SA Wildlife College, Elephant Behavioural Specialist, South Africa
Ingo Schmidinger	Elephant Husbandry – Co-Founder iScapes
Dr Jan Schmidt-Burbach	Veterinarian, Head of Wildlife Research and Animal Welfare, World Animal Protection International
Antoinette Van de Water	Director, Bring the Elephant Home, South Africa
Vasanthi Vadi	CEO – Federation of Indian Animal Protection Organisations – India
Prof Dan Wylie	Rhodes University, South Africa